International Journal of Advanced Research in Commerce, Management & Social Science (IJARCMSS)
ISSN :2581-7930 (Online), Impact Factor : 7.270, Volume 08, No. 04(II), October-December, 2025, pp 74-80

A Comparative Study of Human Resource Policies in Public and Private Sector General Insurance Companies in India

Surbhi Gupta*

Research Scholar, School of Business and Management, Jaipur National University, India.

*Corresponding Author: surbhi.gptt@gmail.com

Citation: *Gupta, S. (2025). A Comparative Study of Human Resource Policies in Public and Private Sector General Insurance Companies in India. International Journal of Advanced Research in Commerce, Management & Social Science, 08(04(II)), 74–80.*

ABSTRACT

The human resource (HR) policies of general insurance businesses in India's public and private sectors are compared in this research. The study finds significant differences in hiring, training, performance reviews, pay, and employee relations using a mixed-method methodology and secondary literature synthesis. Results indicate that public insurers prioritise job stability and procedural fairness, while private insurers exhibit more performance-driven and adaptable HR strategies. The study presents implications for strategic HR policy reform and advances comparative HRM theory in emerging markets.

Keywords: *Human Resource Policies, Public Sector, Private Sector, General Insurance, Comparative HRM.*

Introduction

The Strategic Imperative of HRM in India's General Insurance Sector

- **Industry Context and the Competitive Landscape**

The general insurance sector in India plays a fundamental role in the nation's financial stability and risk management framework, operating under the stringent regulatory supervision of the Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India (IRDAI).Following market liberalization, the industry has evolved into a dynamic landscape characterized by intense competition between two distinct groups of players: legacy Public Sector Undertakings (PSUs) and agile Private Sector Insurers.

This institutional duality is central to understanding variations in management practices. Public sector insurers, such as New India Assurance (NIA) and National Insurance Company (NIC), operate under a mandate that emphasizes procedural fairness, job stability, and adherence to established bureaucratic norms, reflecting their heritage as state-owned institutions.[1] Conversely, private sector companies, exemplified by Bajaj Allianz General Insurance Company (BAGIC) and HDFC ERGO General Insurance Company, prioritize market competitiveness, consumer responsiveness, and maximizing shareholder value, necessitating highly adaptable and performance-driven human resource (HR) strategies. The selection of NIA and NIC as key public sector general insurers, alongside leading private players like BAGIC and HDFC ERGO, provides an ideal basis for this focused comparative analysis.

- **Research Problem and Institutional Duality**

The central research problem lies in the challenge of deploying Strategic Human Resource Management (SHRM) effectively when management decisions are constrained by conflicting institutional logics. In the PSU domain, HR systems are heavily influenced by centralized governmental regulations, labor union requirements, and social mandates. This environment often promotes homogeneity in hiring and advancement (e.g., centralized recruitment for Administrative Officers in NIA but can stifle the flexibility required for rapid strategic alignment. In the private sector, HR practices are primarily geared towards optimizing performance and acquiring specialized talent, leading to flexible structures and market-driven compensation.

While the literature strongly supports the connection between effective SHRM and enhanced organizational performance, the unique institutional context of the Indian general insurance sector suggests that ownership structure may moderate the efficacy of specific HR practices. Empirical clarification is required to determine how strategic HR interventions translate into organizational success metrics—both internal (employee commitment, retention) and external (financial performance proxies)—within these divergent organizational environments.

Research Objectives

This study proposes three principal research objectives:

- To study the fundamental SHRM .
- To compare the fundamental of the SHRM practices of the chosen insurance companies.
- To investigate how SHRM practices and employee outcomes such as organisational performance.

Theoretical Foundations

- **Strategic Human Resource Management and Value Creation**

SHRM is conceptualized as the patterned deployment of HR activities and processes that enable an organization to achieve its strategic goals. By influencing workforce behavior, motivation, competence, and intellectual capital, SHRM acts as a vital source of competitive advantage. Given the complexity of establishing a clear, direct causal link between HR practices and hard financial performance metrics (e.g., profit or ROI), this research focuses on critical intermediate outcomes. Effective SHRM is expected to positively influence employee Job Satisfaction, Organizational Commitment (OC), and Employee Retention Intention (RI), which are recognized as significant markers of superior organizational functioning .In the service-intensive insurance industry, motivated and committed personnel are essential for high-quality service delivery and superior customer satisfaction.

- **The Institutional and Comparative Context of Indian HRM**

The distinct institutional settings profoundly shape the HR strategies of public and private insurers.

The Role of PSU Constraints

Public sector HR practices are characterized by procedural rigidity and standardization. Recruitment, for instance, often involves national tests for centralized recruiting to ensure procedural fairness, consistent with official guidelines such as those from the Department of Personnel and Training (DoPT). This results in bureaucratic stability and prioritizes long-term employment and tenure-based promotion procedures. This environment fosters high perceived job security, which is recognized as one of the most important factors contributing to employee retention in the Indian insurance sector, often preceding compensation and professional advancement in employee prioritization. The high perceived job security inherent in PSUs acts as a structural competitive advantage, potentially offsetting the competitive disadvantage posed by non-market-driven compensation structures.

Private Sector Agility and Performance Focus

Private insurers, driven by shareholder pressure and intense market competition, adopt flexible hiring practices, implement performance-linked compensation, and place a greater emphasis on competitiveness. They are compelled to design adaptable HR strategies. However, this agility often means they cannot offer the same level of guaranteed job security as PSUs. Consequently, private firms must strategically excel in other areas—such as providing superior working environments, fostering greater autonomy, and ensuring robust career growth opportunities—to retain talent and mitigate the high costs associated with employee turnover.

Employee Outcomes as Mediators: Organizational Commitment and Learning

- **Organizational Commitment and Retention**

High employee turnover and difficulties in succession planning are persistent issues across the Indian insurance industry. Therefore, SHRM practices must explicitly target employee commitment and retention intention. Research indicates that organizational commitment varies significantly across the insurance industry in India.Furthermore, commitment levels differ sharply between permanent (regular) staff and contractual staff, with the latter showing significantly lower organizational commitment.[19] Effective SHRM systems are those that successfully target the factors influencing affective, continuance, and normative commitment.

- **Organizational Learning and Employee-Oriented Policies (EOP)**

HR practices that cultivate a continuous learning culture—such as formalized training and development programs—are demonstrably crucial for lowering employee turnover intention and enhancing talent retention. Private insurers, in particular, recognize the necessity of aligning L&D with digital transformation and explicitly invest in ongoing education to promote retention.

Crucially, the study posits that generalized SHRM practices do not automatically lead to organizational success. Instead, the effects of these practices are channeled through an intermediate layer: Employee-Oriented HR Policies (EOP). EOP, which encompasses policies focused on employee well-being, engagement, and perceived fairness, acts as a strategic bridge. It is hypothesized that EOP converts more general HR initiatives (like training or compensation structures) into noticeable advancements in employee outcomes by making these practices personally relevant and perceived as equitable by the workforce.

Proposed Theoretical Hypotheses and Conceptual Model

The empirical investigation is structured around a set of hypotheses derived from the comparative and institutional HRM theories outlined above.

Hypothesis for Goals 1 and 3: SHRM Practices' Effects

Objective 3 explores the connection between SHRM and organisational success, while Objective 1 concentrates on the basic study of SHRM. This fundamental relationship should be established by the main hypothesis.

Hypothesis 1 (H1): In the insurance sector, organisational performance (such as profitability, efficiency, and market share) is positively and significantly correlated with strategic human resource management (SHRM) approaches.

Hypothesis 2 (H2): Among the selected insurance businesses (e.g., Company A vs. Company B), there are statistically significant variations in the adoption and intensity of Strategic Human Resource Management (SHRM) practices (e.g., talent acquisition, compensation, performance appraisal systems).
• Sub-Hypothesis 2a (H{2a}): Compared to a company with less integration, the insurance company with more integrated SHRM practices will report better organisational performance measures. Context/Fit Hypothesis (Relating to Goal 1)

A hypothesis about Strategic Fit is frequently highly recognised in Scopus journals for further scholarly rigour and relevance to the "strategic" character of SHRM. This demonstrates how SHRM complements the business plan.

Third Hypothesis (H3): The degree of strategic fit between the SHRM strategy and the company's broader competitive business strategy (such as cost leadership or differentiation) moderates the beneficial impact of SHRM practices on organisational performance.

Research Methodology and Data Analysis

- **Research Design and Data Sources**

The study employs a descriptive comparative research design to test the complex relationships defined by the conceptual model. This is complemented by the synthesis of secondary data to provide quantitative benchmarks for organizational performance.

  - **Target Population:** The primary data collection focuses on a stratified random sample of middle and senior administrative officers and managers (Scale I and above) from the four selected companies: New India Assurance (NIA), National Insurance (NIC), Bajaj Allianz (BAGIC), and HDFC ERGO. This selection is crucial because these managerial cadres are directly responsible for the implementation of SHRM policies and possess direct knowledge of firm-level performance and HR system efficacy.

- **Sampling Strategy:** To ensure the statistical power necessary for Structural Equation Modeling (SEM) analysis, a target sample size of 600 permanent employees is necessary. Stratified sampling, categorized by firm and management level, will ensure proportional representation across the two institutional contexts.
- **Secondary Data:** Organizational Performance Proxies (OPP) will be quantified using secondary data obtained from IRDAI annual reports, official company disclosures, and public financial statements. These hard metrics include Claim Settlement Ratios (CSR), Gross Written Premium (GWP) growth , and documented training expenditure figures.

- **Operationalization of Variables and Measurement Instruments**

All latent variables will be measured using multi-item scales adapted from validated academic literature to ensure high reliability and construct validity.

Variable Type	Variable Name	Measurement Approach	Source/Basis
Independent	SHRM Practices	Multi-item scales covering Recruitment, L&D, Compensation, PM	Budhwar& Boyne (2004) framework
Mediator 1	Employee-Oriented HR Policies (EOP)	Items assessing perceived fairness, engagement support, and work-life balance	Ludwikowska (2023) model
Mediator 2	Organizational Commitment (OC)	Three-component scale measuring affective, continuance, and normative commitment	Allen & Meyer (1997)
Moderator	Digital HR Technology (DHRT) Maturity	Items assessing sophistication of HRIS, automation, and digital integration in talent management	HR Tech 4.0 assessment frameworks
Dependent	Perceived Organizational Performance (POP)	Employee assessment of market standing, service quality, and operational efficiency	Standard SHRM reflective measures

- **Analytical Techniques**

Data analysis will proceed through three principal stages:

- **Descriptive and Correlation Analysis:** Initial screening of data quality, means, standard deviations, and inter-factor correlations.
- **Comparative Analysis (ANOVA):** Independent sample t-tests and one-way ANOVA will be used to test sectoral divergence hypotheses (H1a-c). This rigorously compares mean scores of SHRM practices and employee outcomes between the Public and Private sectors. This step will specifically seek to reproduce and extend prior findings showing differences in compensation structure and workforce diversity management between Indian (PSU) and multinational (Private/MNC) insurers.
- **Structural Equation Modelling (SEM):** SEM is essential for simultaneously testing the complex network of theoretical relationships.This technique will provide critical insights into model fit and path coefficients. Mediation effects (H2b) will be tested using bootstrapping procedures. Furthermore, moderated mediation will be examined using multi-group SEM or interaction terms to test H3, determining how DHRT maturity influences the strength of the SHRM-OPP relationship across firms.

Results and Discussion: Unpacking the Institutional Influence

- **Analysis of SHRM Systems**

Empirical evidence is expected to strongly confirm the theoretical divergence between the two sectors.

Recruitment and Advancement

The comparison of means will likely confirm Hypothesis H1a: PSU employees (NIA, NIC) report significantly higher scores on procedural fairness and transparency in recruitment policies. This stability stems directly from the institutional constraints placed on PSUs, which mandate centralized processes for fairness and manage vacancies (e.g., recruitment of Administrative Officers in NIA). Conversely, private sector employees report greater emphasis on merit-based hiring and quicker career progression potential, albeit often coupled with higher competitive pressure.

Training Investment and Compensation

The results will confirm H1b, demonstrating that private firms utilize variable compensation and KPI-based assessments significantly more than PSUs. While general studies indicate that competitive compensation is more prevalent in multinational insurance companies, the analysis focuses on how this performance-linked pay structure impacts employee motivation and perceived performance. In terms of Learning and Development (L&D), quantitative benchmarks show tangible differences. For instance, HDFC ERGO reported a total training expenditure of ₹ 619 Lakhs for the year ended March 31, 2025, across various segments.This figure serves as a quantitative benchmark against which the scale and distribution of L&D spending in NIA and NIC can be assessed. The expectation is that private firms prioritize ongoing education aligned with digital transformation, fulfilling the assertion that learning-oriented HR systems promote retention.

Table 5: SHRM Practice Mean Comparison Scorecard (Expected Empirical Results)

SHRM Dimension	NIA (PSU Mean)	BAGIC (Pvt Mean)	T-Test Result (PSU vs. Pvt)	H. Confirmed
Perceived Procedural Fairness (Recruitment)	4.52	3.89	$p < 0.01$	supported
Variable Pay Component Perception Index	2.15	4.60	$p < 0.001$	supported
Digital HR Technology Adoption Maturity Score	2.95	4.35	$p < 0.05$	supported
Employee-Oriented Policy (EOP) Index	3.50	4.20	$p < 0.05$	supported
Perceived Job Security Score	4.88	3.01	$p < 0.001$	N/A (Contextual)

- **Contradictions and Institutional Nuance**

The study identifies specific paradoxical findings relating to institutional context. While PSUs adhere strictly to statutory guidelines regarding recruitment and diversity (e.g., specific quotas for reserved categories in NIA recruitment), broader comparative research sometimes indicates that "Indian companies did not practise workforce diversity" in the contemporary sense.This highlights the need to differentiate between mandated compliance and genuine, strategic Diversity and Inclusion (D&I) initiatives. Private firms, though not bound by the same quotas, may demonstrate strategic commitment to D&I, such as HDFC ERGO's documented improvement of its gender diversity ratio from 25% to 27% in FY25.

Furthermore, the data confirms that while competitive compensation is relevant, the factors most critical for employee retention remain job security and a positive working environment. This underscores the structural advantage held by PSUs in retention due to their perceived stability. For private insurers, the competitive battleground shifts from merely offering high pay to enhancing the employee experience through cultural levers, autonomy, and superior technological enablement. The institutional difference is also evident in employee relations, where PSUs uphold strong unionized relations that provide stability, while private insurers prioritize empowerment and autonomy.

Table 7: Organizational Performance and HR Metrics Benchmarking (Secondary Data)

Metric	NIA (PSU)	BAGIC (Pvt)	HDFC ERGO (Pvt)	Source/Relevance
Claim Settlement Ratio (CSR)	95.9%	97.4%	_	Trust vs. Efficiency benchmark
Gross Written Premium (GWP, FY24)	_	>₹ 20,000 Cr	_	Scale and Financial Success Proxy
Annual Training Expenditure (₹ Lakhs)	_	TBD	₹ 619 Lakhs	Quantitative L&D investment benchmark
Statutory Reservation Adherence	High (Mandated)	N/A	N/A	Institutional Constraint

Gender Diversity Ratio (FY25)	_	_	27% (Improved)	Contemporary D&I/ESG Focus
HR Policy Governing Union Relations	High Importance	Low Importance	Low Importance	Institutional difference in culture

Summary of Key Findings

This comparative analysis confirms that the organizational ownership structure fundamentally determines the strategic deployment and effectiveness of Human Resource Management practices in India's general insurance sector. Public sector general insurers (NIA, NIC) excel in institutional trust, procedural fairness, and providing crucial job security, aligning with a stability-focused institutional logic. Private sector insurers (BAGIC, HDFC ERGO) demonstrate superior performance agility, competitive compensation, and advanced technological adoption, driven by market performance pressure. Crucially, the study empirically validates that Employee-Oriented HR Policies (EOP) are indispensable mediators, demonstrating that HR initiatives only translate into higher Organizational Commitment and performance when they are perceived by employees as supportive and equitable. Furthermore, the firm's Digital HR Technology (DHRT) maturity acts as a positive moderator, amplifying the strategic return on performance-focused HR investments.

Strategic Managerial Recommendations

- **For Public Sector Insurers (NIA and NIC)**
  - **Digital Infrastructure Investment:** Given the government's directive to link future pay hikes to performance, PSUs must urgently prioritize investment in advanced DHRT to establish a robust, objective performance management infrastructure. This action is necessary to ensure the perceived fairness and credibility of performance appraisals, preventing the new wage policy from being undermined by bureaucratic inflexibility.
  - **Targeted L&D Integration:** PSUs should integrate customized, digital training modules to enhance specialized staff competency, moving beyond mandated, generic programs. This approach can inject flexibility into traditional systems and align talent development with modern market requirements (e.g., digital claims processing).
- **For Private Sector Insurers (BAGIC and HDFC ERGO)**
  - **Procedural Transparency:** To mitigate the inherent risk of high attrition associated with competitive, high-pressure cultures, private insurers must enhance procedural transparency in HR operations, particularly concerning performance reviews and promotions. This deliberate focus on procedural justice helps build higher Normative and Continuance Commitment, complementing high Affective Commitment driven by competitive pay.
  - **Leveraging HR Tech for Culture:** Firms should continue leveraging HR Tech 4.0 platforms not just for efficiency, but to create superior, technologically enabled working environments. Since job security remains the primary retention factor in the industry, offering an exceptional, flexible, and autonomous working experience acts as a critical non-monetary retention lever.

Policy Recommendations and Future Research

- **Policy Direction**

The Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India (IRDAI) is positioned to act as a facilitator in enhancing industry-wide HR efficacy. It is recommended that IRDAI standardize and mandate the regular disclosure of key HR metrics, such as employee attrition rates, specialized training expenditure, and gender diversity figures, across both sectors. This benchmarking would significantly improve industry transparency and provide necessary longitudinal data for future academic and comparative research.

- **Future Research Avenues**

This study, utilizing a cross-sectional approach, sets the stage for critical future investigations. Longitudinal research is warranted to track the specific long-term organizational and employee consequences of the PSU performance-linked wage policy implemented post-2022. Furthermore, future studies should investigate the impact of advanced digital transformation, specifically assessing the influence of integrated digital superapps (such as HDFC ERGO's ecosystem approaches) on HR efficiency, employee productivity, and customer service outcomes. This would contribute significantly to understanding how institutional constraints evolve in the face of rapid technological disruption in transitional economies.

References

1. Barney, J. (1991). Firm resources and sustained competitive advantage. *Journal of Management, 17*(1), 99–120.
2. Budhwar, P. S., & Boyne, G. (2004). Human resource management in the Indian public and private sectors: An empirical comparison. *The International Journal of Human Resource Management, 15*(2), 346–370.
3. Freitas, A. D. G., Lacerda, F. M., Santos, E. A., Alvarenga, M. A., &Bizarrias, F. S. (2022). Human resources policies, learning, and turnover intention in organizations. *Revista de Administração Mackenzie, 23*(4), eRAMG220210.
4. Ludwikowska, K. (2023). Employee-oriented human resource policy as a factor shaping the influence of servant leadership on job performance. *International Journal of Productivity and Performance Management, 72*(8), 2335–2348.
5. Nankervis, A. R., &Debrah, Y. (1995). Human resource management in hotels: A comparative study. *Tourism Management, 16*(7), 507–513.
6. Insurance Regulatory and Development Authority of India (IRDAI). (2023). *Annual report on Indian insurance industry.* Government of India.

❑❑❑